Competing orders in the cuprate superconductors

Eugene Demler (Harvard) Kwon Park Anatoli Polkovnikov Subir Sachdev Matthias Vojta (Augsburg) Ying Zhang



Talk online at http://pantheon.yale.edu/~subir



Superconductivity in a doped Mott insulator

<u>Review</u>: S. Sachdev, *Science* **286**, 2479 (1999).

<u>Hypothesis</u>: cuprate superconductors are characterized by additional order parameters, associated with the proximate Mott insulator, along with the familiar order associated with the Bose condensation of Cooper pairs in BCS theory. These orders lead to new low energy excitations

Superconductivity in a doped Mott insulator



Study physics in a generalized phase diagram which includes new phases (which need not be experimentally accessible) with longrange correlations in the additional order parameters. Expansion away from qauntum critical points provides a systematic and controlled theory of the low energy excitations (including their behavior near imperfections such as impurities and vortices and their response to applied fields) and of crossovers into "incoherent" regimes at finite temperature.

Outline

I. Order in Mott insulators

- Magnetic order
 - A. Collinear spins
 - B. Non-collinear spins
- Paramagnetic states
 - A. Bond order and confined spinons
 - B. Topological order and deconfined spinons
- II. Doping Mott insulators with collinear spins and bond order Global phase diagram
- III. Spin density waves (SDW) in LSCO Tuning order and transitions by a magnetic field.
- IV. Connection with LDOS modulations STM experiments on $Bi_2Sr_2CaCu_2O_{8+\delta}$
- V. Conclusions

Magnetic order
$$\langle \mathbf{S}_{j} \rangle = \mathbf{N}_{1} \cos\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right) + \mathbf{N}_{2} \sin\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right)$$

A. Collinear spins



<u>Magnetic order</u> $\langle \mathbf{S}_{j} \rangle = \mathbf{N}_{1} \cos\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right) + \mathbf{N}_{2} \sin\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right)$

A. Collinear spins



Key properties

<u>States can also have</u> <u>bond order.</u> $Q_a(\mathbf{r}_i) \equiv \mathbf{S}_i \cdot \mathbf{S}_{i+a}$ Values of $\langle Q_a(\mathbf{r}_i) \rangle$ modulate with wavevector $2\overline{K}$; $\langle Q_a(\mathbf{0}) \rangle$ is a measure of site charge density

<u>Magnetic order</u> $\langle \mathbf{S}_{j} \rangle = \mathbf{N}_{1} \cos\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right) + \mathbf{N}_{2} \sin\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right)$

A. Collinear spins



Key properties

Order specified by a single vector N.

Quantum fluctuations leading to loss of magnetic order should produce a paramagnetic state with a vector (*S*=1) quasiparticle excitation.

Magnetic order
$$\langle \mathbf{S}_{j} \rangle = \mathbf{N}_{1} \cos\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right) + \mathbf{N}_{2} \sin\left(\vec{K} \cdot \vec{r}_{j}\right)$$

B. Noncollinear spins

(B.I. Shraiman and E.D. Siggia, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **61**, 467 (1988))

$$\overrightarrow{K} = (3\pi/4, \pi);$$

$$\overrightarrow{K} = (3\pi/4, \pi);$$

$$\overrightarrow{N}_2^2 = N_1^2, N_1 \cdot N_2 = 0$$

Solve constraints by expressing $N_{1,2}$ in terms of two complex numbers z_{\uparrow} , z_{\downarrow}

$$\boldsymbol{N}_{1} + i\boldsymbol{N}_{2} = \begin{pmatrix} z_{\downarrow}^{2} - z_{\uparrow}^{2} \\ i\left(z_{\downarrow}^{2} + z_{\uparrow}^{2}\right) \\ 2z_{\uparrow}z_{\downarrow} \end{pmatrix}$$

Order in ground state specified by a spinor $(z_{\uparrow}, z_{\downarrow})$ (modulo an overall sign)

Order parameter space: S_3/Z_2 Physical observables are invariant under the Z_2 gauge transformation $z_a \rightarrow \pm z_a$



Quantum fluctuations leading to loss of magnetic order produce a paramagnetic state with a spinor (S=1/2) quasiparticle excitation, $(z_{\uparrow}, z_{\downarrow})$, with a Z_2 gauge charge, a vison vortex gap, and topological order associated with vison suppression in the ground state. N. Read and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **66**, 1773 (1991)

Paramagnetic states

$$\left< \boldsymbol{S}_{j} \right> = \boldsymbol{0}$$

A. Bond order and spin excitons





S=1/2 spinons are *confined* by a linear potential into a S=1 spin exciton

Such a state is obtained by quantum-``disordering" collinear state with $\overline{K} = (\pi, \pi)$: fluctuating N becomes the S=1 spin exciton and Berry phases induce bond order

N. Read and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 62, 1694 (1989).

Paramagnetic states

$$\left| \boldsymbol{S}_{j} \right\rangle = 0$$

B. Topological order and deconfined spinons





RVB state with free spinons

P. Fazekas and P.W. Anderson, *Phil Mag* **30**, 23 (1974).

Number of valence bonds cutting line is conserved modulo 2 – this is described by the same Z_2 gauge theory as non-collinear spins

D.S. Rokhsar and S. Kivelson, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **61**, 2376 (1988)
N. Read and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **66**, 1773 (1991);
R. Jalabert and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev.* B **44**, 686 (1991);
X. G. Wen, *Phys. Rev.* B **44**, 2664 (1991).
T. Senthil and M.P.A. Fisher, *Phys. Rev.* B **62**, 7850 (2000).

Orders of Mott insulators in two dimensions

N. Read and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **66**, 1773 (1991); S.S. and N.R. *Int. J. Mod. Phys.* B **5**, 219 (1991). <u>A. Collinear spins, Berry phases, and bond order</u>



invariance

Non-collinear ordered antiferromagnet

Topological order: RVB state with Z_2 gauge visons, S=1/2 spinons Bond order in a frustrated S=1/2 XY magnet

A. W. Sandvik, S. Daul, R. R. P. Singh, and D. J. Scalapino, cond-mat/0205270

First large scale numerical study of the destruction of Neel order in a S=1/2antiferromagnet with full square lattice symmetry



 $H = 2J\sum_{\langle ij\rangle} \left(S_i^x S_j^x + S_i^y S_j^y \right) - K\sum_{\langle ijkl\rangle \subset \Box} \left(S_i^+ S_j^- S_k^+ S_l^- + S_i^- S_j^+ S_k^- S_l^+ \right)$

Outline

I. Order in Mott insulators

<u>Magnetic order</u>

A. Collinear spins

B. Non-collinear spins

Paramagnetic states

A. Bond order and confined spinons

B. Topological order and deconfined spinons

II. Doping Mott insulators with collinear spins and bond order Global phase diagram

- III. Spin density waves (SDW) in LSCO Tuning order and transitions by a magnetic field.
- IV. Connection with LDOS modulations STM experiments on $Bi_2Sr_2CaCu_2O_{8+\delta}$
- V. Conclusions

II. Doping Mott insulators with collinear spins and bons order

Doping a paramagnetic bond-ordered Mott insulator

systematic Sp(*N*) theory of translational symmetry breaking, while preserving spin rotation invariance.



S. Sachdev and N. Read, Int. J. Mod. Phys. B 5, 219 (1991).

II.Global phase diagram



II.Global phase diagram



M. Vojta, Y. Zhang, and S. Sachdev,

Phys. Rev. B **62**, 6721 (2000).

M. Vojta, cond-mat/0204284.

See also J. Zaanen, *Physica* C **217**, 317 (1999), S. White and D. Scalapino, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **80**, 1272 (1998). C. Castellani, C. Di Castro, and M. Grilli, *Phys.Rev. Lett.* **75**, 4650 (1995). S. Mazumdar, R.T. Clay, and D.K. Campbell, Phys. Rev. B **62**, 13400 (2000).

Outline

- I. Order in Mott insulators
 - Magnetic order
 - A. Collinear spins
 - B. Non-collinear spins
 - Paramagnetic states
 - A. Bond order and confined spinons
 - B. Topological order and deconfined spinons
- II. Doping Mott insulators with collinear spins and bond order Global phase diagram
- III. <u>Spin density waves (SDW) in LSCO</u> Tuning order and transitions by a magnetic field.
- IV. Connection with LDOS modulations STM experiments on $Bi_2Sr_2CaCu_2O_{8+\delta}$
- V. Conclusions



(additional commensurability effects near δ =0.125)

J. M. Tranquada *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 54, 7489 (1996).
G. Aeppli, T.E. Mason, S.M. Hayden, H.A. Mook, J. Kulda, *Science* 278, 1432 (1997).
S. Wakimoto, G. Shirane *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 60, R769 (1999).
Y.S. Lee, R. J. Birgeneau, M. A. Kastner *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 60, 3643 (1999)
S. Wakimoto, R.J. Birgeneau, Y.S. Lee, and G. Shirane, *Phys. Rev.* B 63, 172501 (2001).



(additional commensurability effects near $\delta=0.125$)

J. M. Tranquada *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 54, 7489 (1996).
G. Aeppli, T.E. Mason, S.M. Hayden, H.A. Mook, J. Kulda, *Science* 278, 1432 (1997).
S. Wakimoto, G. Shirane *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 60, R769 (1999).
Y.S. Lee, R. J. Birgeneau, M. A. Kastner *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 60, 3643 (1999)
S. Wakimoto, R.J. Birgeneau, Y.S. Lee, and G. Shirane, *Phys. Rev.* B 63, 172501 (2001).



(additional commensurability effects near δ =0.125)

J. M. Tranquada *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 54, 7489 (1996).
G. Aeppli, T.E. Mason, S.M. Hayden, H.A. Mook, J. Kulda, *Science* 278, 1432 (1997).
S. Wakimoto, G. Shirane *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 60, R769 (1999).
Y.S. Lee, R. J. Birgeneau, M. A. Kastner *et al.*, *Phys. Rev.* B 60, 3643 (1999)
S. Wakimoto, R.J. Birgeneau, Y.S. Lee, and G. Shirane, *Phys. Rev.* B 63, 172501 (2001).



Use simplest assumption of a direct second-order quantum phase transition between SC and SC+SDW phases

Follow intensity of elastic Bragg spots in a magnetic field

Effect of the Zeeman term: precession of SDW order about the magnetic field



Dominant effect: **uniform** softening of spin excitations by superflow kinetic energy



E. Demler, S. Sachdev, and Ying Zhang, Phys. Rev. Lett. 87, 067202 (2001).



E. Demler, S. Sachdev, and Ying Zhang, Phys. Rev. Lett. 87, 067202 (2001).

D. P. Arovas, A. J. Berlinsky, C. Kallin, and S.-C. Zhang, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **79**, 2871 (1997) proposed static antiferromagnetism in vortex cores in SC phase



E. Demler, S. Sachdev, and Ying Zhang, Phys. Rev. Lett. 87, 067202 (2001).

Lowering of characteristic energy of dynamic spin fluctuations was measured earlier in LSCO by B. Lake, G. Aeppli, K. N. Clausen, D. F. McMorrow, K. Lefmann, N. E. Hussey, N. Mangkorntong, M. Nohara, H. Takagi, T. E. Mason, and A. Schröder, *Science* **291**, 1759 (2001).

Neutron scattering of $La_{2-x}Sr_xCuO_4$ at x=0.1



B. Lake, H. M. Rønnow, N. B. Christensen,
G. Aeppli, K. Lefmann, D. F. McMorrow,
P. Vorderwisch, P. Smeibidl, N.
Mangkorntong, T. Sasagawa, M. Nohara, H.
Takagi, T. E. Mason, *Nature*, 415, 299 (2002).



See also S. Katano, M. Sato, K. Yamada, T. Suzuki, and T. Fukase, *Phys. Rev.* B **62**, R14677 (2000). <u>Neutron scattering measurements of static spin correlations of the</u> <u>superconductor+spin-density-wave (SC+SDW) in a magnetic field</u>





Aside: Topological order with collinear spins (J. Zaanen)

SDW order:
$$S_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r}) = \Phi_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r})e^{i\mathbf{K}\cdot\mathbf{r}} + \text{c.c.}$$

Collinear spins: $\Rightarrow \Phi_{\alpha} = n_{\alpha}e^{i\theta}$ with n_{α} real
 Z_2 gauge symmetry: $n_{\alpha} \rightarrow -n_{\alpha}$ and $\theta \rightarrow \theta + \pi$

Effective action

$$S = -J\sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \sigma_{ij} n_{\alpha i} n_{\alpha j} - J\sum_{\langle ij \rangle} \sigma_{ij} \cos\left(\theta_i - \theta_j\right) - K\sum_{\Box} \prod_{\Box} \sigma_{ij}$$
$$\sigma_{ij} \rightarrow Z_2 \text{ gauge field}$$

Can obtain a topologically ordered state with

$$\langle n_{\alpha} \rangle = 0 \quad ; \quad \langle e^{i\theta} \rangle = 0$$

but Z_2 gauge flux suppressed

P. E. Lammert, D. S. Rokhsar, and J. Toner, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 70, 1650 (1993); *Phys. Rev.* E 52, 1778 (1995) (for nematic liquid crystals)
Y. Zhang, E. Demler and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev.* B 66, 094501 (2002).

Outline

- I. Order in Mott insulators
 - Magnetic order
 - A. Collinear spins
 - B. Non-collinear spins
 - Paramagnetic states
 - A. Bond order and confined spinons
 - B. Topological order and deconfined spinons
- II. Doping Mott insulators with collinear spins and bond order Global phase diagram
- III. Spin density waves (SDW) in LSCO Tuning order and transitions by a magnetic field.
- IV. <u>Connection with LDOS modulations</u> STM experiments on $Bi_2Sr_2CaCu_2O_{8+\delta}$
- V. Conclusions

IV. Connections with LDOS modulations



K. Park and S. Sachdev *Phys. Rev.* B **64**, 184510 (2001). Y. Zhang, E. Demler and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev.* B **66**, 094501 (2002).

IV. Connections with LDOS modulations

SDW order:
$$S_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r}) = \Phi_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r})e^{i\mathbf{K}\cdot\mathbf{r}} + \text{c.c.}$$

Bond order: $Q_{a}(\mathbf{r}) = \sum_{\alpha} S_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r})S_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r}+\mathbf{a}) \approx \sum_{\alpha} \Phi_{\alpha}^{2}(\mathbf{r})e^{i\mathbf{K}\cdot\mathbf{a}}e^{2i\mathbf{K}\cdot\mathbf{r}} + \text{c.c.}$

Superflow reduces energy of dynamic spin exciton, but action so far does not lead to static charge order because all terms are invariant under the "sliding" symmetry:

$$\Phi_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r}) \to \Phi_{\alpha}(\mathbf{r})e^{i\theta}$$

Small vortex cores break this sliding symmetry on the lattice scale, and lead to a pinning term, which picks particular phase of the local bond order

$$S_{\text{pin}} = \zeta \sum_{\text{All } \mathbf{r}_{v}} \sum_{\text{where } \psi(\mathbf{r}_{v})=0} \int_{0}^{1/T} d\tau \left[\sum_{\alpha} \Phi_{\alpha}^{2} (\mathbf{r}_{v}) e^{i\vartheta} + \text{c.c.} \right]$$

With this term, SC phase has bond order but dynamic SDW *i.e.* there is no static spin order (no "spins in vortices")

$$\left\langle \Phi_{\alpha}^{2}\left(\boldsymbol{r}\right)\right\rangle \neq0$$
; $\left\langle \Phi_{\alpha}\left(\boldsymbol{r}\right)\right\rangle =0$

Pinning of static bond order by vortex cores in SC phase, with dynamic SDW correlations



$$\left\langle \Phi_{\alpha}\left(\boldsymbol{r},\tau\right)\right\rangle =0$$



Ying Zhang, E. Demler, and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev.* B 66, 094501 (2002).

Vortex-induced LDOS of $Bi_2Sr_2CaCu_2O_{8+\delta}$ integrated from 1meV to 12meV



J. Hoffman E. W. Hudson, K. M. Lang, V. Madhavan, S. H. Pan, H. Eisaki, S. Uchida, and J. C. Davis, *Science* 295, 466 (2002). <u>IV. STM image of LDOS modulations in</u> <u> $Bi_2Sr_2CaCu_2O_{8+\delta}$ in zero magnetic field</u>



C. Howald, H. Eisaki, N. Kaneko, and A. Kapitulnik, cond-mat/0201546

Spectral properties of the STM signal are sensitive to the microstructure of the charge order



Measured energy dependence of the Fourier component of the density of states which modulates with a period of 4 lattice spacings

C. Howald, H. Eisaki, N. Kaneko, and A. Kapitulnik, cond-mat/0201546



Theoretical modeling shows that this spectrum is best obtained by a modulation of bond variables, such as the exchange, kinetic or pairing energies.

M. Vojta, Phys. Rev. B **66**, 104505 (2002); D. Podolsky, E. Demler, K. Damle, and B.I. Halperin, cond-mat/0204011

<u>Global phase diagram</u>



Conclusions

- I. Cuprate superconductivity is associated with doping Mott insulators with charge carriers. The correct paramagnetic Mott insulator has bond-order and confinement of spinons (collinear spins in magnetically ordered state.
- II. Theory of quantum phase transitions provides semiquantitative predictions for neutron scattering measurements of spin-density-wave order in superconductors; theory also proposes a connection to STM experiments.
- III. Future experiments should search for SC+SDW to SC quantum transition driven by a magnetic field.
- IV. Major open question: how does understanding of low temperature order parameters help explain anomalous behavior at high temperatures ?