



Talk online: sachdev.physics.harvard.edu

Quantum entanglement in nature: high temperature superconductors and black holes

> New York University October 3, 2024

> > Subir Sachdev







Boltzmann-Landau theory of metals







Density of quantum states $D(E) = \exp(S(E)/k_B)$

Ludwig Boltzmann 20 February 1844 - September 5, 1906 Vienna, Austria





Statistical interpretation of entropy (1870)

$S = k_B \log W$



No perpetual motion machines!













Ludwig Boltzmann 20 February 1844 - September 5, 1906 Vienna, Austria

Boltzmann equation (1872) Dilute classical gas

Molecular chaos: successive collisions are statistically independent

$$\cdot \nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}} f_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \boldsymbol{F} \cdot \nabla_{\boldsymbol{p}} f_{\boldsymbol{p}} =$$

 $-2\pi \int_{\mathbf{p}_{1,0,2}} |\mathcal{T}|^{2} \delta(\varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}} + \varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}_{1}} - \varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}_{2}} - \varepsilon_{\mathbf{p}_{3}}) \delta(\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{p}_{1} - \mathbf{p}_{2} - \mathbf{p}_{3})$

 $\times \left[f_{\boldsymbol{p}}f_{\boldsymbol{p}_1} - f_{\boldsymbol{p}_2}f_{\boldsymbol{p}_3}\right]$









Ludwig Boltzmann 20 February 1844 - September 5, 1906 Vienna, Austria

Quantum Boltzmann equation (Landau) Dense gas of electrons

Neglects quantum interference (entanglement) between successive collisions

$$\cdot \nabla_{\boldsymbol{r}} f_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \boldsymbol{F} \cdot \nabla_{\boldsymbol{p}} f_{\boldsymbol{p}} =$$

$$|\mathcal{T}|^2 \delta(\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}} + \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}_1} - \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}_2} - \varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{p}_3}) \delta(\boldsymbol{p} + \boldsymbol{p}_1 - \boldsymbol{p}_2)$$

 $\times [f_{\mathbf{p}} f_{\mathbf{p}_1} (1 - f_{\mathbf{p}_2}) (1 - f_{\mathbf{p}_3}) - f_{\mathbf{p}_2} f_{\mathbf{p}_3} (1 - f_{\mathbf{p}_1}) (1 - f_{\mathbf{p}_1})]$





 $(-p_3)$

Current flow with electrons in ordinary metals



Flow of electrons described by Boltzmann equation \Rightarrow typical scattering time $\tau \sim 1/(UT)^2$ (U is the strength of interactions), resistivity $\rho(T) = \rho(0) + AT^2$

The time τ is much longer than a limiting 'Planckian time' $\frac{h}{k_{P}T}$.

The long scattering time implies that individual electrons are well-defined.

The motion of electrons is 'ballistic' or 'integrable' up to the long time τ , after which it is chaotic.



High temperature superconductivity



Kamerlingh Onnes 1911: Mercury is a superconductor below -269 $^\circ\mathrm{C}$

Cuprate high temperature superconductors









Nd-Fe-B magnets, YBaCuO superconductor

Julian Hetel and Nandini Trivedi, Ohio State University

HTS Magnets: Enabling Technology

The surest path to limitless, clean, fusion energy

YBCO magnets allow for smaller, faster, and less expensive tokamaks for plasma fusion







































Reconciling scaling of the optical conductivity of cuprate superconductors with Planckian resistivity and specific heat

B. Michon, C. Berthod, C. W. Rischau, A. Ataei, L. Chen, S. Komiya, S. Ono, L. Taillefer, D. van der Marel, A. Georges *Nature Communications* **14**, Article number: 3033 (2023)





Quantum entanglement (1865)



Kekule's spooky dream (1865)

Kekulé spoke of the creation of the theory. He said that he had discovered the ring shape of the benzene molecule after having a reverie or day-dream of a snake seizing its own tail^{*}















ቃ

<u>Kekule's spooky dream (1865)</u>

Kekulé spoke of the creation of the theory. He said that he had discovered the ring shape of the benzene molecule after having a reverie or day-dream of a snake seizing its own tail^{*}













MAY 15, 1935 PHYSICAL REVIEW

Can Quantum-Mechanical Description of Physical Reality Be Considered Complete?

A. EINSTEIN, B. PODOLSKY AND N. ROSEN, Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, New Jersey (Received March 25, 1935)

VOLUME 47







Quantum Entanglement





Quantum Entanglement





Quantum Entanglement





Measurement of one electron instantaneously determines the state of the other electron very far away

Quantum Entanglement



Measurement of one electron instantaneously determines the state of the other electron very far away

Quantum Entanglement

Einstein, Podolsky, Rosen (1935)

V



Measurement of one electron instantaneously determines the state of the other electron very far away

Quantum Entanglement

Einstein, Podolsky, Rosen (1935)

Spooky action at a distance !

 \mathbf{V}



I cannot seriously believe in it because the theory cannot be reconciled with the idea that physics should represent a reality in time and space, free from spooky actions at distance

Albert Einstein to Max Born, 3 March 1947



Needed, to solve open problems in the theory of superconductivity and black holes:

A solvable model of quantum entanglement of $3, 4, 5, \ldots \infty$ particles



Needed, to solve open problems in the theory of superconductivity and black holes:

A solvable model of quantum entanglement of $3, 4, 5, \ldots \infty$ particles

The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev model of many-particle entanglement



Kekule's spooky dream (1865)

Kekulé spoke of the creation of the theory. He said that he had discovered the ring shape of the benzene molecule after having a reverie or day-dream of a snake seizing its own tail^{*}















My spoky dream (1992)* Ancient Indian game of Snakes and Ladders *Not true



My spoky dream (1992)*

Hasbro game of Chutes and Ladders *Not true







Place electrons randomly on some sites














Entangle electrons pairwise randomly







Entangle electrons pairwise randomly





(See also: the "2-Body Random Ensemble" in nuclear physics; did not obtain the large N limit; T.A. Brody, J. Flores, J.B. French, P.A. Mello, A. Pandey, and S.S.M. Wong, Rev. Mod. Phys. 53, 385 (1981))



 $c_{\alpha}c_{\beta} + c_{\beta}c_{\alpha} = 0$

 $Q = \frac{1}{N} \sum c_{\alpha}^{\dagger} c_{\alpha}; \quad [\mathcal{H}, Q] = 0; \quad 0 \le Q \le 1$

 $N \to \infty$ yields critical strange metal.



$$U_{\alpha\beta;\gamma\delta} c^{\dagger}_{\alpha} c^{\dagger}_{\beta} c_{\gamma} c_{\delta} - \mu \sum_{\alpha} c^{\dagger}_{\alpha} c_{\alpha}$$

,
$$c_{\alpha}c_{\beta}^{\dagger} + c_{\beta}^{\dagger}c_{\alpha} = \delta_{\alpha\beta}$$

$U_{\alpha\beta;\gamma\delta}$ are independent random variables with $\overline{U_{\alpha\beta;\gamma\delta}} = 0$ and $|U_{\alpha\beta;\gamma\delta}|^2 = U^2$ S. Sachdev and J.Ye, PRL **70**, 3339 (1993)

A. Kitaev, unpublished; S. Sachdev, PRX 5, 041025 (2015)





Feynman graph expansion in $U_{\alpha\beta;\gamma\delta}$, and graph-by-graph average, yields exact equations in the large N limit:

$$G(i\omega) = rac{1}{i\omega + \mu - \Sigma(i\omega)}$$

 $G(au = 0)$
 $\sum_{eta lpha \delta} rac{U^2}{N^3} = U^2$



, $\Sigma(\tau) = -U^2 G^2(\tau) G(-\tau)$

 $\mathbf{P}^{-})=\mathcal{Q}.$



S. Sachdev and J.Ye, PRL 70, 3339 (1993)





The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev (SYK) model Sachdev, Ye (1993); Kitaev (2015) A solvable model of multi-particle quantum entanglement.

No quasiparticles: yields a metal in which current is carried

not by individual electrons,

but by an entangled "quantum soup"

The SYK model

Consequences of emergent time-reparameterization and conformal symmetries in low-energy theory in 0+1 spacetime dimensions: 1. Planckian dynamics!

 $\tau(\omega) = \frac{1}{k_F}$

S. Sachdev and J.Ye, PRL 70, 3339 (1993); A. Georges and O. Parcollet PRB 59, 5341 (1999)

$$\frac{\hbar}{_BT}F\left(\frac{\hbar\omega}{k_BT}\right)$$



The SYK model

Consequences of emergent time-reparameterization and conformal symmetries in low-energy theory in 0+1 spacetime dimensions: 1. Planckian dynamics!

 $\tau(\omega) = \frac{1}{k_{I}}$

2. Zero temperature entropy $\lim_{T \to 0} \lim_{N \to \infty} \frac{1}{N} S(T) = s_0 \quad , \quad D(E \to 0) = e^{Ns_0} f_{\text{smooth}}(E)$ $s_0 = 0.46484769917080510749...$ for Q = 1/2.

A. Georges, O. Parcollet, and S. Sachdev (GPS), Physical Review B 63, 134406 (2001)

$$\frac{\hbar}{_BT}F\left(\frac{\hbar\omega}{k_BT}\right)$$







From the SYK model to the universal 2d-YSYK theory of strange metals

Aavishkar A. Patel, Haoyu Guo, Ilya Esterlis, S. Sachdev, Science 381, 790 (2023)



Aavishkar Patel Flatiron



Haoyu Guo Cornell



Ilya Esterlis Wisconsin





Ordinary Metal

 $T_{\rm c}$



 $YBa_2Cu_3O_{6+x}$

0.3









"Pseudogap metal" Fermi surface modified by electron-electron interactions

> Fermi surface as expected in a model of free electrons

0.3

 (π,π)









View the strange metal as a property of a T = 0quantum phase transition involving change in the Fermi surface.

The onset of superconductivity may "hide" this quantum transition.





Quantum phase transitions of Fermi surface change



Fermi surface a boson ϕ with a 'mass' s and a boson-fermion Yukawa coupling g.



$$\langle \phi \rangle = 0$$

S





Spatially random Yukawa coupling q'(r)with $g'_{\alpha\beta\gamma}(\mathbf{r}) = 0, \ g'_{\alpha\beta\gamma}(\mathbf{r})g'_{abc}(\mathbf{r'}) = g'^2\delta_{\alpha a}\delta_{\beta b}\delta_{\gamma c}\delta(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r'})$

Quantum phase transitions of Fermi surface change

Universal theory: the two-dimensional Yukawa-Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev model

> **Key ingredient:** spatial disorder in quantum critical coupling associated with $g'(\mathbf{r})$.

Spatially uniform theory does not yield a strange metal; but a perfect metal.

Aavishkar A. Patel, Haoyu Guo, Ilya Esterlis, S. Sachdev, Science 381, 790 (2023)







Strange metal and superconductor in the two-dimensional Yukawa-Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev model

Chenyuan Li, Aavishkar A. Patel, Haoyu Guo, Davide Valentinis, Jorg Schmalian, S.S., Ilya Esterlis, PRL in press; arXiv:2406.07608



Ilya Esterlis Wisconsin



Haoyu Guo Cornell



Davide Valentinis KIT





Aavishkar Patel Flatiron

Chenyuan Li Harvard \rightarrow Rice



Joerg Schmalian KIT



Strange metal and superconductor in the two-dimensional Yukawa-Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev model

Chenyuan Li, Aavishkar A. Patel, Haoyu Guo, Davide Valentinis, Jorg Schmalian, S.S., Ilya Esterlis, PRL in press; arXiv:2406.07608







Reconciling scaling of the optical conductivity of cuprate superconductors with Planckian resistivity and specific heat

B. Michon, C. Berthod, C. W. Rischau, A. Ataei, L. Chen, S. Komiya, S. Ono, L. Taillefer, D. van der Marel, A. Georges *Nature Communications* **14**, Article number: 3033 (2023)



 $La_{2-x}Sr_{x}CuO_{4}$ p = 0.24 $T_{c} = 19 \, {\rm K}$

Strange metal and superconductor in the two-dimensional Yukawa-Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev model

Chenyuan Li, Aavishkar A. Patel, Haoyu Guo, Davide Valentinis, Jorg Schmalian, S.S., Ilya Esterlis, PRL in press; arXiv:2406.07608





 ω/t



Reconciling scaling of the optical conductivity of cuprate superconductors with Planckian resistivity and specific heat

B. Michon, C. Berthod, C. W. Rischau, A. Ataei, L. Chen, S. Komiya, S. Ono, L. Taillefer, D. van der Marel, A. Georges *Nature Communications* **14**, Article number: 3033 (2023)

70 — 15 K — 20 K — 30 K 60 0.3 50 — 100 K — 150 K — 200 K — 250 K \hbar/ au (eV) $\frac{\hbar/\tau}{k_{\rm B}T} \frac{40}{30}$ 20 0.1 $\epsilon_{\infty} = 2.76$ 10 K = 211 meV0 0.3 0.1 0.2 0.4 $\left(\right)$ $\hbar\omega$ (eV)

$$\sigma(\omega) = i \frac{e^2 K/(\hbar d_c)}{\hbar \omega \frac{m^*(\omega)}{m} + i \frac{\hbar}{\tau(\omega)}}$$
Planckian dynamic

$$\frac{h/\tau}{k_{\rm B}T} \frac{40}{30}$$
Planckian dynamic

$$\tau(\omega) = \frac{\hbar}{k_{\rm B}T} F\left(\frac{\hbar \omega}{k_{\rm B}T}\right)$$
and entropy

$$S(T \to 0) \sim T \ln(1/t)$$

$$La_{2-x} Sr_x CuO_x$$

$$p = 0.24$$

$$T_c = 19 \text{ K}$$



Strange metal and superconductor in the two-dimensional Yukawa-Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev model

Chenyuan Li, Aavishkar A. Patel, Haoyu Guo, Davide Valentinis, Jorg Schmalian, S.S., Ilya Esterlis, arXiv:2406.07608



Planckian dynamics! $\tau(\omega) = \frac{\hbar}{k_B T} F\left(\frac{\hbar\omega}{k_B T}\right)$ and entropy $S(T \to 0) \sim T \ln(1/T)$ in 2d-YSYK model (unlike zero temperature) entropy in SYK model).







From the SYK model to the universal, low energy (near-extremal) density of quantum states of charged and rotating black holes

Black Holes

Objects so dense that light is gravitationally bound to them.

Karl Schwarzschild (1916)

G Newton's constant, c velocity of light, M mass of black hole For $M = \text{earth's mass}, R \approx 9 \, mm!$









What is inside a black hole ???

In Einstein's theory, all the matter in a black hole collapses to a singularity at the center of the black hole.





Quantum Entanglement across a black hole horizon



Quantum Entanglement across a black hole horizon



Quantum Entanglement across a black hole horizon



Bekenstein, Hawking: Black holes have a temperature and an entropy!

To an outside observer, the state of the electron inside the black hole cannot be known, and so the outside electron is in a random state.



Quantum Entanglement across a black hole horizon



Black hole horizon





Quantum entanglement on the surface





Quantum Entanglement across a black hole horizon

By computations <u>outside</u> the black hole, Bekenstein-Hawking obtained

$$S = \frac{k_B A c^3}{4G\hbar}$$

where A is area of the black hole horizon.

All other systems have entropy proportional to their volume.



Black hole horizon



Quantum Black Holes

of statistical mechanics, $S(E) = k_B \log D(E)$?



• Can we find a quantum theory for the collapsed matter at the center of the black hole, whose density of quantum states D(E)[the quantum analog of Boltzmann's W] matches Bekenstein-Hawking entropy, in accordance with Boltzmann's principles



Quantum Black Holes

of statistical mechanics, $S(E) = k_B \log D(E)$?

For a black hole with charge Q, the area $A_0 = 2G\mathcal{Q}^2/c^4 \text{ as } T \to 0,$ and so $S(T \rightarrow 0) > 0$.

G.W. Gibbons and S.W. Hawking, PRD 15, 2572 (1977)

• Can we find a quantum theory for the collapsed matter at the center of the black hole, whose density of quantum states D(E)[the quantum analog of Boltzmann's W] matches Bekenstein-Hawking entropy, in accordance with Boltzmann's principles





Black Holes Obey Information-Emission April 22, 2021 • *Physics* 14, s47 Limits

G. Carullo, D. Laghi, J. Veitch, W. Del Pozzo, Phys. Rev. Lett. 126, 161102 (2021)

An analysis of the gravitational waves emitted from black hole mergers confirms that black holes are the fastest

known information dissipaters.

Planckian dynamics!

$$\tau(\omega) = \frac{\hbar}{k_B T} F\left(\frac{\hbar\omega}{k_B T}\right)$$

Gravity wave observations of 8 different black holes show a relaxation time

-Christopher Crockett




<u>Connections between the SYK model and black holes</u>

• Planckian time ~ $\hbar/(k_B T)$ relaxation dynamics ('chaos').

S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 151602 (2010)

<u>Connections between the SYK model and black holes</u>

- Planckian time ~ $\hbar/(k_B T)$ relaxation dynamics ('chaos').
- Charged black holes have a non-zero Bekenstein-Hawking entropy in the limit $T \to 0$:

of the charged black hole horizon at T = 0.

- $S_{BH} = A_0 c^3 / (4\hbar G)$ where $A_0 = 2GQ^2 / c^4$ is the area
- This matches the $T \to 0$ entropy Ns_0 , of the SYK model. Similar remarks apply to rotating neutral black holes.

S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 151602 (2010)

Connections between the SYK model and black holes

- Planckian time ~ $\hbar/(k_B T)$ relaxation dynamics ('chaos').
- Charged black holes have a non-zero Bekenstein-Hawking entropy in the limit $T \rightarrow 0$:

of the charged black hole horizon at T = 0.

- This matches the $T \to 0$ entropy Ns_0 , of the SYK model. Similar remarks apply to rotating neutral black holes.
- This connection shows that S_{BH} is not realized by an exponentially large ground state degeneracy (as is the case in all earlier string-theoretic computations).

 $S_{BH} = A_0 c^3 / (4\hbar G)$ where $A_0 = 2GQ^2 / c^4$ is the area

S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 151602 (2010)



 $\mathcal{Z}(\mathcal{Q},T) = \int \mathcal{D}g_{\mu\nu}\mathcal{D}A_{\mu} \,\mathrm{e}t$



$$\exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar} I_{\text{Einstein gravity+Maxwell EM}}^{(3+1)} [g_{\mu\nu}, A_{\mu\nu}]\right)$$

A. Chamblin, R. Emparan, C.V. Johnson, and R.C. Myers, PRD 60,064018 (1999)







 $\mathcal{Z}(\mathcal{Q},T) = \int \mathcal{D}g_{\mu\nu}\mathcal{D}A_{\mu}$ es $\approx \exp\left(\frac{A_0c^3}{4\hbar G}\right) \quad \text{as } T \to 0$



G.W. Gibbons and S.W. Hawking, PRD 15, 2572 (1977)

$$\exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar} I_{\text{Einstein gravity+Maxwell EM}}^{(3+1)} [g_{\mu\nu}, A_{\mu\nu}]\right)$$







Kitaev (2015); Maldacena, Stanford, Yang (2016)

 $\mathcal{Z}(\mathcal{Q},T) = \int \mathcal{D}g_{\mu\nu}\mathcal{D}A_{\mu} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar} I_{\text{Einstein gravity+Maxwell EM}}^{(3+1)}[g_{\mu\nu},A_{\mu}]\right)$ $\approx \exp\left(\frac{A_0c^3}{4\hbar G}\right) \int \mathcal{D}g_{\mu\nu} \mathcal{D}A_{\mu} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar} I_{\rm JT\ gravity\ of\ AdS_2+boundary\ graviton}[g_{\mu\nu}, A_{\mu}]\right)$





$$\mathcal{Z}(\mathcal{Q},T) = \int \mathcal{D}g_{\mu\nu}\mathcal{D}A_{\mu} \,\mathrm{exp}\left(\frac{A_0c^3}{4\hbar G}\right) \int \mathcal{D}g_{\mu\nu}\mathcal{D}A_{\mu} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}H_{\mathrm{SYK}}^{(0+1)}\right) \,\mathrm{exp}\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}I_{\mathrm{SYK}}^{(0+1)}\right) \,\mathrm{free}^{-\frac{1}{\hbar}}$$



Kitaev (2015); Maldacena, Stanford, Yang (2016); Cotler et al. (2017)

uantum entanglement on the surface



The path integral over the action $I_{SYK}^{(0+1)}$ can be evaluated exactly,

and leads to a computation of D(E)

$$\mathcal{Z}(\mathcal{Q},T) = \int dED(E) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\right) dED(E) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}$$

Kitaev (2015); Maldacena, Stanford, Yang (2016); Cotler et al. (2017)



of quantum states at small energy E is



D. Chowdhury, A. Georges, O. Parcollet, and S. S., Rev. Mod. Phys. 94, 035004 (2022)

Quantum simulation of charged black holes by the SYK model



The SYK model simulates the low energy properties of the interior of the black hole for an outside observer in ζ - τ co-ordinates.







The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev (SYK) model

The SYK model describes multi-particle quantum entanglement resulting in the loss of identity of the particles

The SYK model describes multi-particle quantum entanglement resulting in the loss of identity of the particles

A 2d-YSYK theory describes the strange metal behavior of numerous quantum materials



The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev (SYK) model



The SYK model describes multi-particle quantum entanglement resulting in the loss of identity of the particles

A 2d-YSYK theory describes the strange metal behavior of numerous quantum materials

In a *dual* set of variables the SYK model has led to the computation of the low energy density of states of charged black holes

The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev (SYK) model



