## A simple model of many-particle entanglement: how it describes black holes and superconductors





University of New Mexico February 5, 2021

Subir Sachdev

Talk online: sachdev.physics.harvard.edu

PHYSICS



# Quantum entanglement

Hydrogen atom:



Hydrogen molecule:





Einstein-Podolsky-Rosen "paradox" (1935): Measurement of one particle instantaneously determines the state of the other particle arbitrarily far away

# Quantum entanglement

## Quantum entanglement

# A simple many-particle (SYK) model

#### The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev (SYK) model



Pick a set of random positions





Place electrons randomly on some sites





Place electrons randomly on some sites





Place electrons randomly on some sites



































































(See also: the "2-Body Random Ensemble" in nuclear physics; did not obtain the large N limit; T.A. Brody, J. Flores, J.B. French, P.A. Mello, A. Pandey, and S.S.M. Wong, Rev. Mod. Phys. **53**, 385 (1981))

$$\mathcal{H} = \frac{1}{(2N)^{3/2}} \sum_{i,j,k,\ell=1}^{N} U_{ij;k\ell} c_i^{\dagger} c_j^{\dagger} c_k c_\ell - \mu \sum_i c_i^{\dagger} c_i$$
$$c_i c_j + c_j c_i = 0 \quad , \quad c_i c_j^{\dagger} + c_j^{\dagger} c_i = \delta_{ij}$$
$$\mathcal{Q} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i c_i^{\dagger} c_i$$

 $U_{ij;k\ell}$  are independent random variables with  $\overline{U_{ij;k\ell}} = 0$  and  $|\overline{U_{ij;k\ell}}|^2 = U^2$  $N \to \infty$  yields critical strange metal.



S. Sachdev and J.Ye, PRL **70**, 3339 (1993)

A. Kitaev, unpublished; S. Sachdev, PRX 5, 041025 (2015)

Complex multi-particle entanglement in the SYK model leads to a state without 'quasiparticle' excitations; *i.e.* multiple excitations cannot be built by composing an elementary set of 'quasiparticle' excitations. Complex multi-particle entanglement in the SYK model leads to a state without 'quasiparticle' excitations; *i.e.* multiple excitations cannot be built by composing an elementary set of 'quasiparticle' excitations.

> Many-body chaos and thermal equilibration in the shortest possible Planckian time  $\sim \frac{\hbar}{k_B T}$ .

#### <u>Main result I</u>

For  $k_B T \ll U$ 

$$\mathcal{Z} = \operatorname{Tr} \exp\left(-\frac{\mathcal{H}}{k_B T}\right)$$
$$= \exp\left(N\frac{S_0}{k_B}\right) \int \mathcal{D}f(\tau) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}S_{2\mathrm{D-gravity}}\left[f(\tau)\right]\right)$$

### <u>Main result l</u>

For  $k_B T \ll U$ 

S

### <u>Main result l</u>

For  $k_B T \ll U$ 

$$\mathcal{Z} = \operatorname{Tr} \exp\left(-\frac{\mathcal{H}}{k_B T}\right)$$
$$= \exp\left(N\frac{S_0}{k_B}\right) \int \mathcal{D}f(\tau) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}\mathcal{S}_{2\mathrm{D-gravity}}\left[f(\tau)\right]\right)$$

•  $f(\tau)$  is the reparameterization of the imaginary time of the SYK model:  $\tau$  on a circle of circumference  $\hbar/(k_B T)$ .

### <u>Main result l</u>

For  $k_B T \ll U$ 

$$\mathcal{Z} = \operatorname{Tr} \exp\left(-\frac{\mathcal{H}}{k_B T}\right)$$
$$= \exp\left(N\frac{S_0}{k_B}\right) \int \mathcal{D}f(\tau) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}\mathcal{S}_{2\mathrm{D-gravity}}\left[f(\tau)\right]\right)$$

- $f(\tau)$  is the reparameterization of the imaginary time of the SYK model:  $\tau$  on a circle of circumference  $\hbar/(k_B T)$ .
- $f(\tau)$  is also the fluctuation of the boundary of a theory of 2Dgravity in 1+1 spacetime dimensions: a 'boundary graviton'.




A simple many-particle (SYK) model **Black Holes** 

Objects so dense that light is gravitationally bound to them.

In Einstein's theory, the region inside the black hole horizon is disconnected from the rest of the universe.

Horizon radius  $R = \frac{2GM}{c^2}$ 



G Newton's constant, c velocity of light, M mass of black hole







### There is quantum entanglement between the inside and outside of a black hole





Hawking used this to show that black hole horizons have an entropy and a temperature (because to an outside observer, the state of the electron inside the black hole is an unknown)



# Quantum Black holes

- Black holes have an entropy and a temperature,  $T_H$ .
- The entropy,  $S_{BH}$  is proportional to their surface area.

J. D. Bekenstein, PRD **7**, 2333 (1973) S.W. Hawking, Nature **248**, 30 (1974)





# Quantum Black holes

- Black holes have an entropy and a temperature,  $T_H$
- The entropy is proportional to their surface area.
- They relax to thermal equilibrium in a Planckian time  $\sim \hbar/(k_B T_H)$ .











Zooming into the nearhorizon region of a charged black hole at low temperature, yields a gravitational theory in one space ( $\zeta$ ) and one time dimension



Ń

This 2D-gravity theory is precisely that appearing in the low T limit of the Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev (SYK) models



$$I_{EM} = \int d^{d+2}x \sqrt{g} \left[ -\frac{1}{2\kappa^2} \left( \mathcal{R}_{d+2} + \frac{d(d+1)}{L^2} \right) + \frac{1}{4g_F^2} F^2 \right]$$

Metric  $g_{\mu\nu}$ Ricci scalar in d + 2 dimensions,  $\mathcal{R}_{d+2}$ Cosmological constant  $\Lambda = -d(d+1)/L^2$ U(1) gauge field  $A_{\mu}$ Electromagnetic field  $F_{\mu\nu} = \partial_{\mu}A_{\nu} - \partial_{\nu}A_{\mu}$ 

Boundary conditions at spatial infinity: Metric  $\rightarrow \operatorname{AdS}_{d+2}$ Electric field  $\rightarrow \mathcal{Q}/(4\pi r^2)$ 



$$I_{EM} = \int d^{d+2}x \sqrt{g} \left[ -\frac{1}{2\kappa^2} \left( \mathcal{R}_{d+2} + \frac{d(d+1)}{L^2} \right) + \frac{1}{4g_F^2} F^2 \right]$$

Quantum gravity is 'defined' by the path integral

$$\mathcal{Z}_{\text{gravity}} = \int \mathcal{D}g \mathcal{D}A \exp(-I_{EM}/\hbar)$$

This integral is evaluated exactly in a certain low temperature limit for charged black holes.







For  $T \ll 1/R_h$ 

<u>Main result II</u>

 $\mathcal{Z}_{charged black hole in EM theory} =$ 

$$\exp\left(\frac{S_{BH}}{k_B}\right) \int \mathcal{D}f(\tau) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}\mathcal{S}_{2\mathrm{D-gravity}}\left[f(\tau)\right]\right)$$

For  $T \ll 1/R_h$ 

<u>Main result II</u>

 $\mathcal{Z}_{charged black hole in EM theory} =$ 

$$\exp\left(\frac{S_{BH}}{k_B}\right) \int \mathcal{D}f(\tau) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{\hbar}\mathcal{S}_{2\mathrm{D-gravity}}\left[f(\tau)\right]\right)$$

$$\mathcal{S}_{\text{2D-gravity}}\left[f(\tau)\right] = -\frac{\gamma}{4\pi^2} \int_0^{1/T} d\tau \left\{ \tan(\pi T f(\tau)), \tau \right\},$$

where  $f(\tau)$  is a monotonic map from [0, 1/T] to [0, 1/T], and we have used the Schwarzian:

$$\{g,\tau\} \equiv \frac{d^3g/d\tau^3}{dg/d\tau} - \frac{3}{2} \left(\frac{d^2g/d\tau^2}{dg/d\tau}\right)^2$$

The defining property of the Schwarzian is its invariance under SL(2,R) transformations

$$\left\{\frac{ag(\tau)+b}{cg(\tau)+d},\tau\right\} = \left\{g(\tau),\tau\right\}$$

Remarkably, this path integral can be evaluated exactly, using the Duistermaat–Heckman formula (Stanford, Witten, arXiv:1703.04612).

#### <u>Main result</u>

S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 105, 151602 (2010) A. Kitaev (2015) S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. X 5, 041025 (2015) J. Maldacena and D. Stanford, Phys. Rev. D 94, 106002 (2016) J. Maldacena, D. Stanford, and Zhenbin Yang, PTEP 12C104 (2016) K. Jensen, Phys. Rev. Lett. **17**, 111601 (2016) J. Engelsoy, T.G. Mertens, and H. Verlinde, JHEP 1607 (2016) 139 R. Davison, Wenbo Fu, A. Georges, Yingfei Gu, K. Jensen, S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B **95**, 155131 (2017) A. Gaikwad, L.K. Joshi, G. Mandal, and S.R. Wadia, arXiv: 1802.07746 P. Nayak, A. Shukla, R.M. Soni, S.P. Trivedi, and V. Vishal, arXiv: 1802.09547 P. Chaturvedi, Yingfei Gu, Wei Song, Boyang Yu, arXiv: 1808.08062 U. Moitra, S. P. Trivedi, and V. Vishal, arXiv: 1808.08239 S. Sachdev, arXiv: 1902.04078





Complex multi-particle entanglement leads to quantum systems without quasiparticle excitations.

> Many-body chaos and thermal equilibration in the shortest possible Planckian time  $\sim \frac{\hbar}{k_B T}$ .





A simple many-particle (SYK) model

# Copper-based superconductors



## Insulating antiferromagnet



### Antiferromagnet doped with hole density p


























## Momentum-space view



*1-p* mobile electrons = *1+p* mobile holes in a filled band

# Momentum-space view at large p



M. Platé, J. D. F. Mottershead, I. S. Elfimov, D. C. Peets, Ruixing Liang, D. A. Bonn, W. N. Hardy, S. Chiuzbaian, M. Falub, M. Shi, L. Patthey, and A. Damascelli, Phys. Rev. Lett. **95**, 077001 (2005)

## Momentum-space view at small p



 $Ca_{2-x}Na_{x}CuO_{2}Cl_{2}$ 

at x = 0.10

Kyle M. Shen, F. Ronning, D. H. Lu, F. Baumberger, N. J. C. Ingle, W. S. Lee, W. Meevasana, Y. Kohsaka, M. Azuma, M. Takano, H. Takagi, Z.-X. Shen, Science **307**, 901 (2005)

#### Hidden magnetism at the pseudogap critical point of a high temperature superconductor Nature Physics 16, 1064 (2020)

Mehdi Frachet<sup>1</sup>†, Igor Vinograd<sup>1</sup>†, Rui Zhou<sup>1,2</sup>, Siham Benhabib<sup>1</sup>, Shangfei Wu<sup>1</sup>, Hadrien Mayaffre<sup>1</sup>, Steffen Krämer<sup>1</sup>, Sanath K. Ramakrishna<sup>3</sup>, Arneil P. Reyes<sup>3</sup>, Jérôme Debray<sup>4</sup>, Tohru Kurosawa<sup>5</sup>, Naoki Momono<sup>6</sup>, Migaku Oda<sup>5</sup>, Seiki Komiya<sup>7</sup>, Shimpei Ono<sup>7</sup>, Masafumi Horio<sup>8</sup>, Johan Chang<sup>8</sup>, Cyril Proust<sup>1</sup>, David LeBoeuf<sup>1\*</sup>, Marc-Henri Julien<sup>1\*</sup>











#### Henry Shackleton





Alexander Wietek

### arXiv:2012.06589

Antoine Georges



Maria Tikhanovskaya





Haoyu Guo

arXiv:2010.09742 arXiv:2012.14449

Grigory Tarnopolsky





























### One particle energy distribution function



where  $|\lambda\rangle$  are one-particle eigenstates of the  $t_{ij}$ . In a Fermi liquid, the Luttinger identity implies that  $\mathcal{N}(\epsilon)$  has a discontinuity at the free particle Fermi energy  $\epsilon_F$ .  $(D(\epsilon)$  is the Wigner semi-circle density of states.)

Evidence for a "Large Fermi surface" for  $p > p_c \approx 0.4$ 

#### Dynamic spin susceptibility

 $\chi''(\omega) = \sum_{n} |\langle 0| S_{+i} |n\rangle|^2 \,\delta(\hbar\omega - E_n + E_0), \,(\text{at } T = 0)$ 



#### Dynamic spin susceptibility

 $\chi''(\omega) = \sum_{n} |\langle 0| S_{+i} |n\rangle|^2 \,\delta(\hbar\omega - E_n + E_0), \,(\text{at } T = 0)$ 



Spin glass order q non-zero for  $p < p_c \approx 0.4$ 

### Dynamic spin susceptibility

 $\chi''(\omega) = \sum_{n} |\langle 0| S_{+i} |n\rangle|^2 \,\delta(\hbar\omega - E_n + E_0), \,(\text{at } T = 0)$ 



Consequences of 2D-gravity for the SYK model

$$\chi''(\omega) = \sum_{n} |\langle 0| S_{+i} |n\rangle|^2 \,\delta(\hbar\omega - E_n + E_0), \,(\text{at } T = 0)$$

$$\chi''(\omega) \sim \tanh\left(\frac{\hbar\omega}{2k_BT}\right) \left[1 - \mathcal{C}\gamma\,\omega\tanh\left(\frac{\hbar\omega}{2k_BT}\right) - \ldots\right]$$



Maria Tikhanovskaya, Haoyu Guo, S. Sachdev, G. Tarnopolsky, arXiv: 2010.09742, 2012.14449



Maria Tikhanovskaya, Haoyu Guo, S. Sachdev, G. Tarnopolsky, arXiv: 2010.09742, 2012.14449

 $\omega/T$ 



Maria Tikhanovskaya, Haoyu Guo, S. Sachdev, G. Tarnopolsky, arXiv: 2010.09742, 2012.14449

 $\omega/T$ 

#### The random t-J model has

- Spin glass order for  $p < p_c$ .
- Fermi liquid with *"large Fermi surface"* for  $p > p_c$
- Maxima in entropy, specific heat, and entanglement entropy near  $p = p_c$
- SYK-Planckian criticality near  $p_c$ .
- *Boundary graviton* correction in critical spin susceptibility!

#### The random t-J model has

- Spin glass order for  $p < p_c$ .
- Fermi liquid with *"large Fermi surface"* for  $p > p_c$
- Maxima in entropy, specific heat, and entanglement entropy near  $p = p_c$
- SYK-Planckian criticality near  $p_c$ .
- Boundary graviton correction in critical spin susceptibility!
- SYK criticality can be understood in a model in which the electron fractionalizes into spinons and holons: then both the t and J terms map onto 4-particle SYK terms.

D. G. Joshi, Chenyuan Li, G. Tarnopolsky, A. Georges, and S. Sachdev, PRX 10, 021033 (2020)

Quantum entanglement

# Charged black holes

A simple many-particle (SYK) model

# Copper-based superconductors

# Copper-based superconductors



Complex multi-particle entanglement leads to quantum systems without quasiparticle excitations.

> Many-body chaos and thermal equilibration in the shortest possible Planckian time  $\sim \frac{\hbar}{k_B T}$ .