Breakdown of the Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson paradigm at quantum phase transitions

Science **303**, 1490 (2004); cond-mat/0312617 cond-mat/0401041

> Leon Balents (UCSB) Matthew Fisher (UCSB) S. Sachdev (Yale) T. Senthil (MIT) Ashvin Vishwanath (MIT)





Outline

A. Magnetic quantum phase transitions in "dimerized" Mott insulators Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson (LGW) theory

B. Mott insulators with spin *S*=1/2 per unit cell *Berry phases, bond order, and the breakdown of the LGW paradigm* A. Magnetic quantum phase transitions in "dimerized" Mott insulators:

Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson (LGW) theory: Second-order phase transitions described by fluctuations of an order parameter associated with a broken symmetry



M. Matsumoto, B. Normand, T.M. Rice, and M. Sigrist, cond-mat/0309440.

Coupled Dimer Antiferromagnet

M. P. Gelfand, R. R. P. Singh, and D. A. Huse, *Phys. Rev. B* **40**, 10801-10809 (1989). N. Katoh and M. Imada, *J. Phys. Soc. Jpn.* **63**, 4529 (1994).

J. Tworzydlo, O. Y. Osman, C. N. A. van Duin, J. Zaanen, Phys. Rev. B 59, 115 (1999).

M. Matsumoto, C. Yasuda, S. Todo, and H. Takayama, Phys. Rev. B 65, 014407 (2002).

S=1/2 spins on coupled dimers

















 $\bigcirc = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\uparrow \downarrow \right) - \left| \downarrow \uparrow \right\rangle \right)$





 $\bigcirc = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\uparrow \downarrow \right) - \left| \downarrow \uparrow \right\rangle \right)$





 $\bigcirc = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\uparrow \downarrow \right) - \left| \downarrow \uparrow \right\rangle \right)$





 $\bigcirc = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\uparrow \downarrow \right) - \left| \downarrow \uparrow \right\rangle \right)$

 λ close to 0

Weakly coupled dimers



 $\bigcirc = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\uparrow \downarrow \right) - \left| \downarrow \uparrow \right\rangle \right)$







FIG. 1. Measured neutron profiles in the a^*c^* plane of TlCuCl₃ for i = (1.35, 0, 0), ii = (0, 0, 3.15) [r.l.u]. The spectrum at T = 1.5 K

Coupled Dimer Antiferromagnet





Weakly dimerized square lattice





Weakly dimerized square lattice



TICuCl₃

Neutron Diffraction Study of the Pressure-Induced Magnetic Ordering in the Spin Gap System TlCuCl₃

Akira OOSAWA*, Masashi FUJISAWA1, Toyotaka OSAKABE, Kazuhisa KAKURAI and Hidekazu TANAKA2

Advanced Science Research Center, Japan Atomic Energy Research Institute, Tokai, Ibaraki 319-1195 ¹Department of Physics, Tokyo Institute of Technology, Oh-okayama, Meguro-ku, Tokyo 152-8551 ²Research Center for Low Temperature Physics, Tokyo Institute of Technology, Oh-okayama, Meguro-ku, Tokyo 152-8551 (Received February 3, 2003)



Fig. 3. Temperature dependence of the magnetic Bragg peak intensity for Q = (1, 0, -3) reflection measured at P = 1.48 GPa in TlCuCl₃.

J. Phys. Soc. Jpn 72, 1026 (2003)







The method of bond operators (S. Sachdev and R.N. Bhatt, *Phys. Rev.* B **41**, 9323 (1990)) provides a quantitative description of spin excitations in TlCuCl₃ across the quantum phase transition (M. Matsumoto, B. Normand, T.M. Rice, and M. Sigrist, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **89**, 077203 (2002))

Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson theory: write down an effective action for the antiferromagnetic order parameter $\vec{\phi}$ by expanding in powers of $\vec{\phi}$ and its spatial and temporal derivatives, while preserving all symmetries of the microscopic Hamiltonian

$$S_{\varphi} = \int d^2 x d\tau \left[\frac{1}{2} \left(\left(\nabla_x \vec{\varphi} \right)^2 + c^2 \left(\partial_\tau \vec{\varphi} \right)^2 + \left(\lambda_c - \lambda \right) \vec{\varphi}^2 \right) + \frac{u}{4!} \left(\vec{\varphi}^2 \right)^2 \right]$$

S. Chakravarty, B.I. Halperin, and D.R. Nelson, Phys. Rev. B 39, 2344 (1989)

Landau-Ginzburg-Wilson theory: write down an effective action for the antiferromagnetic order parameter $\vec{\phi}$ by expanding in powers of $\vec{\phi}$ and its spatial and temporal derivatives, while preserving all symmetries of the microscopic Hamiltonian

$$S_{\varphi} = \int d^2 x d\tau \left[\frac{1}{2} \left(\left(\nabla_x \vec{\varphi} \right)^2 + c^2 \left(\partial_\tau \vec{\varphi} \right)^2 + \left(\lambda_c - \lambda \right) \vec{\varphi}^2 \right) + \frac{u}{4!} \left(\vec{\varphi}^2 \right)^2 \right]$$

S. Chakravarty, B.I. Halperin, and D.R. Nelson, Phys. Rev. B 39, 2344 (1989)

For $\lambda < \lambda_c$, oscillations of $\vec{\varphi}$ about $\vec{\varphi} = 0$ constitute the *triplon* excitation

A.V. Chubukov, S. Sachdev, and J.Ye, Phys. Rev. B 49, 11919 (1994)

Key reason for validity of LGW theory

Classical statistical mechanics: There is a simple high temperature disordered state with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$ and exponentially decaying correlations

Quantum mechanics: There is a "quantum disordered" non-degenerate ground state with $\langle \vec{\phi} \rangle = 0$ and an energy gap to all excitations B. Mott insulators with spin S=1/2 per unit cell:

Berry phases, bond order, and the breakdown of the LGW paradigm







Ground state has Neel order with $\vec{\varphi} \neq 0$



Destroy Neel order by perturbations which preserve full square lattice symmetry *e.g.* second-neighbor or ring exchange. The strength of this perturbation is measured by a coupling *g*. Small $g \Rightarrow$ ground state has Neel order with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle \neq 0$ Large $g \Rightarrow$ paramagnetic ground state with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$



Destroy Neel order by perturbations which preserve full square lattice symmetry *e.g.* second-neighbor or ring exchange. The strength of this perturbation is measured by a coupling *g*. Small $g \Rightarrow$ ground state has Neel order with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle \neq 0$ Large $g \Rightarrow$ paramagnetic ground state with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$



Possible large g paramagnetic ground state with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$











Mott insulator with one S=1/2 spin per unit cell



Mott insulator with one S=1/2 spin per unit cell



Mott insulator with one S=1/2 spin per unit cell



Mott insulator with one S=1/2 spin per unit cell



Mott insulator with one S=1/2 spin per unit cell



Ingredient missing from LGW theory: Spin Berry Phases



Ingredient missing from LGW theory: Spin Berry Phases





Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_{a} = 2\eta_{a}\vec{S}_{a} \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_{a} = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_{a} = 2\eta_{a}\vec{S}_{a} \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_{a} = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;

 $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow half$ oriented area of spherical triangle



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_a = 2\eta_a \vec{S}_a \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_a = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;

 $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow half$ oriented area of spherical triangle



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_{a} = 2\eta_{a}\vec{S}_{a} \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_{a} = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;

 $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow half$ oriented area of spherical triangle



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_{a} = 2\eta_{a}\vec{S}_{a} \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_{a} = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;

 $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow half$ oriented area of spherical triangle



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_{a} = 2\eta_{a}\vec{S}_{a} \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_{a} = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;

 $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow half$ oriented area of spherical triangle

formed by $\vec{\varphi}_{a}$, $\vec{\varphi}_{a+\mu}$, and an arbitrary reference point $\vec{\varphi}_{0}$

$$2A_{a\mu} \rightarrow 2A_{a\mu} - \gamma_{a+\mu} + \gamma_a$$

Change in choice of $\vec{\varphi}_0$ is like a "gauge transformation"



Discretize imaginary time: path integral is over fields on the sites of a cubic lattice of points a

Recall $\vec{\varphi}_{a} = 2\eta_{a}\vec{S}_{a} \rightarrow \vec{\varphi}_{a} = (0,0,1)$ in classical Neel state;

 $\eta_{\rm a} \rightarrow \pm 1$ on two square sublattices ;

 $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow half$ oriented area of spherical triangle

formed by $\vec{\varphi}_{a}$, $\vec{\varphi}_{a+\mu}$, and an arbitrary reference point $\vec{\varphi}_{0}$

$$2A_{a\mu} \rightarrow 2A_{a\mu} - \gamma_{a+\mu} + \gamma_a \qquad \gamma_a$$

Change in choice of $\vec{\varphi}_0$ is like a "gauge transformation"



The area of the triangle is uncertain modulo 4π , and the action has to be invariant under $A_{a\mu} \rightarrow A_{a\mu} + 2\pi$

Ingredient missing from LGW theory: Spin Berry Phases



$$\exp\left(i\sum_{a}\eta_{a}A_{a\tau}\right)$$

Sum of Berry phases of all spins on the square lattice.

Partition function on cubic lattice

$$Z = \prod_{a} \int d\vec{\varphi}_{a} \delta\left(\vec{\varphi}_{a}^{2} - 1\right) \exp\left(\frac{1}{g} \sum_{a,\mu} \vec{\varphi}_{a} \cdot \vec{\varphi}_{a+\mu}\right)$$

LGW theory: weights in partition function are those of a classical ferromagnet at a "temperature" *g*

Small $g \Rightarrow$ ground state has Neel order with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle \neq 0$

Large $g \Rightarrow$ paramagnetic ground state with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$

Partition function on cubic lattice

$$Z = \prod_{a} \int d\vec{\varphi}_{a} \delta\left(\vec{\varphi}_{a}^{2} - 1\right) \exp\left(\frac{1}{g} \sum_{a,\mu} \vec{\varphi}_{a} \cdot \vec{\varphi}_{a+\mu} + i \sum_{a} \eta_{a} A_{a\tau}\right)$$

Modulus of weights in partition function: those of a classical ferromagnet at a "temperature" *g*

Small $g \Rightarrow$ ground state has Neel order with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle \neq 0$

Large $g \Rightarrow$ paramagnetic ground state with $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle = 0$ Berry phases lead to large cancellations between different time histories \rightarrow need an effective action for $A_{a\mu}$ at large g S. Sachdev and K. Park, Annals of Physics, **298**, 58 (2002) Simplest large g effective action for the $A_{a\mu}$

$$Z = \prod_{a,\mu} \int dA_{a\mu} \exp\left(\frac{1}{2e^2} \sum_{\Box} \cos\left(\Delta_{\mu} A_{a\nu} - \Delta_{\nu} A_{a\mu}\right) + i \sum_{a} \eta_a A_{a\tau}\right)$$

with $e^2 \sim g^2$

This is compact QED in 3 spacetime dimensions with static charges ± 1 on two sublattices.

N. Read and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 62, 1694 (1989).
S. Sachdev and R. Jalabert, *Mod. Phys. Lett.* B 4, 1043 (1990).
S. Sachdev and K. Park, *Annals of Physics*, 298, 58 (2002)

Exact duality transform on periodic Gaussian ("Villain") action for compact QED yields a representation in terms of a Coulomb gas of monopoles

$$Z_{\text{dual}} = \sum_{\{m_{\bar{j}}\}} \exp\left(-\frac{\pi}{2e^2} \sum_{\bar{j},\bar{j}'} \frac{m_{\bar{j}}m_{\bar{j}'}}{|r_{\bar{j}} - r_{\bar{j}'}|} + 2\pi i \sum_{\bar{j}} m_{\bar{j}} \mathcal{X}_{\bar{j}}\right)$$

with the $m_{\bar{\jmath}}$ integer monopole charges. Each monopole carries a Berry phase (F.D.M. Haldane, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **61**, 1029 (1988)) determined by the fixed $\mathcal{X}_{\bar{\jmath}} = 0, 1/4, 1/2, 3/4$ on the four dual sublattices.



N. Read and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **62**, 1694 (1989).

Alternative representation is in terms of a "height" model

$$Z_{\text{dual}} = \sum_{\{h_{\bar{j}}\}} \exp\left(-\frac{e^2}{2} \sum_{\bar{j}} \left(\Delta_{\mu} h_{\bar{j}} - \Delta_{\mu} \mathcal{X}_{\bar{j}}\right)^2\right)$$

with the $h_{\bar{j}}$ integer heights. The Berry phases now lead to height 'offsets' $\mathcal{X}_{\bar{j}} = 0, 1/4, 1/2, 3/4$ on the four dual sublattices.



For large e^2 , low energy height configurations are in exact one-toone correspondence with nearest-neighbor valence bond pairings of the sites square lattice



There is no roughening transition for three dimensional interfaces, which are smooth for all couplings

D.S. Fisher and J.D. Weeks, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **50**, 1077 (1983).

- \Rightarrow There is a definite average height of the interface
- → Ground state has bond order.

N. Read and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. Lett. 62, 1694 (1989).

$$Z = \prod_{a} \int d\vec{\varphi}_{a} \delta\left(\vec{\varphi}_{a}^{2} - 1\right) \exp\left(\frac{1}{g} \sum_{a,\mu} \vec{\varphi}_{a} \cdot \vec{\varphi}_{a+\mu} + i \sum_{a} \eta_{a} A_{a\tau}\right)$$

?



Neel order $\langle \vec{\varphi} \rangle \neq 0$

