# Quantum matter without quasiparticles

Topological Insulators and Mathematical Science Center for Mathematical Sciences and Applications, Harvard September 17, 2014

Subir Sachdev

Talk online: sachdev.physics.harvard.edu

PHYSICS



Foundations of quantum many body theory: I. Ground states connected adiabatically to independent electron states



Foundations of quantum many body theory: I. Ground states connected adiabatically to independent electron states

2. Boltzmann-Landau theory of quasiparticles



Modern phases of quantum matter:

I. Ground states disconnected from independent electron states: many-particle entanglement

2. Boltzmann-Landau theory of quasiparticles

## Famous example:

The <u>fractional quantum Hall</u> effect of electrons in two dimensions (e.g. in graphene) in the presence of a strong magnetic field. The ground state is described by Laughlin's wavefunction, and the excitations are *quasiparticles* which carry fractional charge. <u>Modern phases of quantum matter:</u>

 I. Ground states disconnected from independent electron states: many-particle entanglement
2. No quasiparticles Modern phases of quantum matter:

 I. Ground states disconnected from independent electron states: many-particle entanglement
2. No quasiparticles

Only 2 examples:

I. Conformal field theories in spatial dimension d > 1

**2.** Quantum critical metals in dimension d=2

Modern phases of quantum matter:

 I. Ground states disconnected from independent electron states: many-particle entanglement
2. No quasiparticles

Only 2 examples:

I. Conformal field theories in spatial dimension d > 1

**2**. Quantum critical metals in dimension d=2





William Witczak-Krempa Perimeter



Erik Sorensen McMaster

Emanuel Katz Boston University

# Outline

- 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions
- 2. Boltzmann dynamics
- 3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$
- 4. Holography

# Outline

1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions

2. Boltzmann dynamics

3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$ 

4. Holography

#### The Superfluid-Insulator transition

#### Boson Hubbard model

Bosons,  $b_j$  hopping on the sites j of a square lattice with Hamiltonian

$$H = -t \sum_{\langle ij \rangle} b_i^{\dagger} b_j + \frac{U}{2} \sum_j n_j (n_j - 1)$$
$$n_j \equiv b_i^{\dagger} b_i$$

The boson operators obey the commutation relation

$$[b_j, b_k^{\dagger}] = \delta_{jk}$$

We restrict attention to the sector of the Fock space with

 $\sum_{j} n_{j} = \text{integer multiple of the number of sites}$ 



### Insulator (the vacuum) at large repulsion between bosons

# $|\text{Ground state}\rangle = \prod_{i} b_i^{\dagger} |0\rangle$

















Holes  $\sim \psi$ 





Holes  $\sim \psi$ 







### Insulator (the vacuum) at large repulsion between bosons

# $|\text{Ground state}\rangle = \prod_{i} b_i^{\dagger} |0\rangle$



## Superfluid at small repulsion between bosons

 $|\text{Ground state}\rangle = \left|\sum_{i} b_{i}^{\dagger}\right|^{N} |0\rangle$ 



 $\Psi \sim b_{k=0} \rightarrow$  a complex field representing the Bose-Einstein condensate of the superfluid









Primary operators of CFT,  $O_a(x)$ , obey ( at T = 0):

$$\langle O_a(x)O_b(0)\rangle = \frac{\delta_{ab}}{|x|^{2\Delta_a}}$$

where  $\Delta_a$  is their scaling dimension. Their "interactions" are determined by the OPE (considering scalar operators only)



The values of  $\{\Delta_a, f_{abc}\}$  determine (in principle) all observable properties of the CFT, as constrained by conformal Ward identities. For the Wilson-Fisher CFT3, systematic methods exist to compute (in principle) all the  $\{\Delta_a, f_{abc}\}$ , and we will assume this data is *known*. This knowledge will be taken as an *input* to the computation of the finite T dynamics

Important sets of operators are the energy-momentum tensor  $T_{\mu\nu}$ , and conserved currents of continuous symmetries  $J_{\mu}$ . For CFT2s, the  $T_{\mu\nu}$  obey the Virasoro algebra, while the  $J_{\mu}$  obey the Kac-Moody algebra: in particular ( $z = x + i\tau$ )

$$\langle J(z)J(0)\rangle = \frac{k}{z^2}$$

where k is the (integer) central charge.

Important sets of operators are the energy-momentum tensor  $T_{\mu\nu}$ , and conserved currents of continuous symmetries  $J_{\mu}$ . For CFT2s, the  $T_{\mu\nu}$  obey the Virasoro algebra, while the  $J_{\mu}$  obey the Kac-Moody algebra: in particular ( $z = x + i\tau$ )

$$\langle J(z)J(0)\rangle = \frac{k}{z^2}$$

where k is the (integer) central charge.

CFT3s are much more complicated. In momentum space we have

$$\langle J_{\mu}(p)J_{\nu}(0)\rangle = -\sigma_{\infty}|p|\left(\delta_{\mu\nu} - \frac{p_{\mu}p_{\nu}}{p^2}\right)$$

where  $\sigma_{\infty}$  is (almost certainly) an irrational number. From the Kubo formula, we can show that  $\sigma_{\infty}$  is equal to the *conductivity*,  $\sigma(\omega)$ , (in units of  $e^2/\hbar$ ) of the CFT3. So the Wilson-Fisher CFT3 (and also the Bose-Hubbard model) has a universal, frequency-independent, conductivity.

We will need higher-order terms in the OPE of 2 currents in CFT3s. This has the general form

$$\lim_{|\omega|\gg p} J_x(\omega) J_x(-\omega + \mathbf{p}) = -|\omega| \sigma_{\infty} \delta^{(3)}(\mathbf{p}) - \frac{\mathcal{C}}{|\omega|^{\Delta - 1}} \mathcal{O}(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{\mathcal{C}_T}{\omega^2} \Big[ T_{xx}(\mathbf{p}) - T_{yy}(\mathbf{p}) - 12\gamma (T_{xx}(\mathbf{p}) + T_{yy}(\mathbf{p})) \Big] + \cdots$$

where  $\mathcal{O}$  is the scalar operator of dimension  $\Delta = 3 - 1/\nu$  (it tunes away from the critical point), and  $\mathcal{C}$ ,  $\mathcal{C}_T$ ,  $\gamma$  are OPE coefficients. There is a conjectured exact bound  $|\gamma| \leq 1/12$ .

#### E. Katz, S. Sachdev, E. Sorensen, and W. Witczak-Krempa, arXiv: 1409.3841

# Outline

- 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions
- 2. Boltzmann dynamics
- 3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$
- 4. Holography

# Outline

## 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions

2. Boltzmann dynamics

3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$ 

4. Holography










Traditional CMT

Identify quasiparticles and their dispersions

Compute scattering matrix elements of quasiparticles (or of collective modes) Traditional CMT

Identify quasiparticles and their dispersions

Compute scattering matrix elements of quasiparticles (or of collective modes)

These parameters are input into a quantum Boltzmann equation

Deduce dissipative and dynamic properties at nonzero temperatures

### Quasiparticle view of quantum criticality (Boltzmann equation): Electrical transport for a free CFT3



Quasiparticle view of quantum criticality (Boltzmann equation): Electrical transport for a (weakly) interacting CFT3



K. Damle and S. Sachdev, *Phys. Rev. B* 56, 8714 (1997).

Quasiparticle view of quantum criticality (Boltzmann equation): Electrical transport for a (weakly) interacting CFT3



K. Damle and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 56, 8714 (1997).

Quasiparticle view of quantum criticality (Boltzmann equation): Electrical transport for a (weakly) interacting CFT3



# Outline

- 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions
- 2. Boltzmann dynamics
- 3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$
- 4. Holography

# Outline

- 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions
- 2. Boltzmann dynamics

3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$ 

4. Holography

Traditional CMT

Identify quasiparticles and their dispersions

Compute scattering matrix elements of quasiparticles (or of collective modes)

These parameters are input into a quantum Boltzmann equation

Deduce dissipative and dynamic properties at nonzero temperatures

## Traditional CMT

Identify quasiparticles and their dispersions

Compute scattering matrix elements of quasiparticles (or of collective modes)

These parameters are input into a quantum Boltzmann equation

Deduce dissipative and dynamic properties at non-zero temperatures

## **Dynamics without quasiparticles**

Start with strongly interacting CFT without particle- or wave-like excitations

Compute scaling dimensions and OPE co-efficients of operators of the CFT

### Basic characteristics of CFTs

We will need higher-order terms in the OPE of 2 currents in CFT3s. This has the general form

$$\lim_{|\omega|\gg p} J_x(\omega) J_x(-\omega + \mathbf{p}) = -|\omega| \sigma_{\infty} \delta^{(3)}(\mathbf{p}) - \frac{\mathcal{C}}{|\omega|^{\Delta - 1}} \mathcal{O}(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{\mathcal{C}_T}{\omega^2} \Big[ T_{xx}(\mathbf{p}) - T_{yy}(\mathbf{p}) - 12\gamma (T_{xx}(\mathbf{p}) + T_{yy}(\mathbf{p})) \Big] + \cdots$$

where  $\mathcal{O}$  is the scalar operator of dimension  $\Delta = 3 - 1/\nu$  (it tunes away from the critical point), and  $\mathcal{C}$ ,  $\mathcal{C}_T$ ,  $\gamma$  are OPE coefficients. There is a conjectured exact bound  $|\gamma| \leq 1/12$ .

### Basic characteristics of CFTs

We will need higher-order terms in the OPE of 2 currents in CFT3s. This has the general form

$$\lim_{|\omega|\gg p} J_x(\omega) J_x(-\omega + \mathbf{p}) = -|\omega| \sigma_{\infty} \delta^{(3)}(\mathbf{p}) - \frac{\mathcal{C}}{|\omega|^{\Delta - 1}} \mathcal{O}(\mathbf{p}) + \frac{\mathcal{C}_T}{\omega^2} \Big[ T_{xx}(\mathbf{p}) - T_{yy}(\mathbf{p}) - 12\gamma (T_{xx}(\mathbf{p}) + T_{yy}(\mathbf{p})) \Big] + \cdots$$

where  $\mathcal{O}$  is the scalar operator of dimension  $\Delta = 3 - 1/\nu$  (it tunes away from the critical point), and  $\mathcal{C}$ ,  $\mathcal{C}_T$ ,  $\gamma$  are OPE coefficients. There is a conjectured exact bound  $|\gamma| \leq 1/12$ .

For T > 0, compute the conductivity by taking thermal average of the OPE.

### Basic characteristics of CFTs

The thermal average of the OPE yields for  $\omega \gg T$ 

$$\sigma(\omega) = \sigma_{\infty} + b_1 \left(\frac{T}{\omega}\right)^{3-1/\nu} + b_2 \left(\frac{T}{\omega}\right)^3 + \dots$$

where  $b_{1,2}$  are universal numbers. The bare OPE expansion yields no information for  $\omega \sim T$  or smaller. For the O(2) Wilson-Fisher CFT3,  $\nu \approx 0.6717(1)$ .

For T > 0, compute the conductivity by taking thermal average of the OPE.

## <u>Quantum Monte Carlo for lattice model of integer currents</u> (Villain model)



## Excellent agreement with OPE

# Outline

- 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions
- 2. Boltzmann dynamics
- 3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$
- 4. Holography

# Outline

- 1. A CFT in 2+1 dimensions
- 2. Boltzmann dynamics
- 3. Dynamics from the operator product expansion (OPE) for  $\hbar \omega \gg k_B T$

4. Holography

## Traditional CMT

Identify quasiparticles and their dispersions

Compute scattering matrix elements of quasiparticles (or of collective modes)

These parameters are input into a quantum Boltzmann equation

Deduce dissipative and dynamic properties at non-zero temperatures

## **Dynamics without quasiparticles**

Start with strongly interacting CFT without particle- or wave-like excitations

Compute scaling dimensions and OPE co-efficients of operators of the CFT

## Traditional CMT

Identify quasiparticles and their dispersions

Compute scattering matrix elements of quasiparticles (or of collective modes)

These parameters are input into a quantum Boltzmann equation

Deduce dissipative and dynamic properties at non-zero temperatures

## **Dynamics without quasiparticles**

Start with strongly interacting CFT without particle- or wave-like excitations

Compute scaling dimensions and OPE co-efficients of operators of the CFT

Relate OPE co-efficients to couplings of an effective gravitational theory on AdS

Non-zero T dynamics of CFT maps to dynamics of a "horizon" in (Einstein's) gravitational theory Field theories in d + 1 spacetime dimensions are characterized by couplings g which obey the renormalization group equation

$$u\frac{dg}{du} = \beta(g)$$

where u is the energy scale. The RG equation is local in energy scale, *i.e.* the RHS does not depend upon u.



J. McGreevy, arXiv0909.0518



J. McGreevy, arXiv0909.0518



**Key idea:**  $\Rightarrow$  Implement r as an extra dimension, and map to a local theory in d + 2 spacetime dimensions.

For a relativistic CFT in d spatial dimensions, the metric in the holographic space is uniquely fixed by demanding the following scale transformation  $(i = 1 \dots d)$ 

$$x_i \to \zeta x_i \quad , \quad t \to \zeta t \quad , \quad ds \to ds$$

For a relativistic CFT in d spatial dimensions, the metric in the holographic space is uniquely fixed by demanding the following scale transformation  $(i = 1 \dots d)$ 

$$x_i \to \zeta x_i \quad , \quad t \to \zeta t \quad , \quad ds \to ds$$

This gives the unique metric

$$ds^{2} = \frac{1}{r^{2}} \left( -dt^{2} + dr^{2} + dx_{i}^{2} \right)$$

Reparametrization invariance in r has been used to the prefactor of  $dx_i^2$  equal to  $1/r^2$ . This fixes  $r \to \zeta r$  under the scale transformation. This is the metric of the space  $\mathrm{AdS}_{d+2}$ .





Consider a CFT in D space-time dimensions with primary operators  $O_a(\boldsymbol{x})$  with scaling dimension  $\Delta_a$ . This is presumed to be equivalent to a dual gravity theory on  $\mathrm{AdS}_{D+1}$ with action  $S_{\mathrm{bulk}}$ . The bulk theory has fields  $\phi_a(\boldsymbol{x},r)$  corresponding to each primary operator. The CFT and the bulk theory are related by the GKPW ansatz

$$\int \mathcal{D}\phi_a \exp\left(-\mathcal{S}_{\text{bulk}}\right) \bigg|_{\text{bdy}} = \left\langle \exp\left(\int d^D x \,\phi_{a0}(\boldsymbol{x}) O_a(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \right\rangle_{\text{CFT}}$$

where the boundary condition is

$$\lim_{r \to 0} \phi_a(\boldsymbol{x}, r) = r^{D - \Delta} \phi_{a0}(\boldsymbol{x}).$$

For every primary operator  $O(\mathbf{x})$  in the CFT, there is a corresponding field  $\phi(\mathbf{x}, r)$  in the bulk (gravitational) theory. For a scalar operator  $O(\mathbf{x})$  of dimension  $\Delta$ , the correlators of the boundary and bulk theories are related by

$$\langle O(\boldsymbol{x}_1) \dots O(\boldsymbol{x}_n) \rangle_{\mathrm{CFT}} =$$
  
 $Z^n \lim_{r \to 0} r_1^{-\Delta} \dots r_n^{-\Delta} \langle \phi(\boldsymbol{x}_1, r_1) \dots \phi(\boldsymbol{x}_n, r_n) \rangle_{\mathrm{bulk}}$ 

where the "wave function renormalization" factor  $Z = (2\Delta - D)$ .

For a U(1) conserved current  $J_{\mu}$  of the CFT, the corresponding bulk operator is a U(1) gauge field  $A_{\mu}$ . With a Maxwell action for the gauge field

$$\mathcal{S}_M = \frac{1}{4g_M^2} \int d^{D+1}x \sqrt{g} F_{ab} F^{ab}$$

we have the bulk-boundary correspondence

$$\langle J_{\mu}(\boldsymbol{x}_{1}) \dots J_{\nu}(\boldsymbol{x}_{n}) \rangle_{\text{CFT}} = (Zg_{M}^{-2})^{n} \lim_{r \to 0} r_{1}^{2-D} \dots r_{n}^{2-D} \langle A_{\mu}(\boldsymbol{x}_{1}, r_{1}) \dots A_{\nu}(\boldsymbol{x}_{n}, r_{n}) \rangle_{\text{bulk}}$$

with Z = D - 2.

A similar analysis can be applied to the stress-energy tensor of the CFT,  $T_{\mu\nu}$ . Its conjugate field must be a spin-2 field which is invariant under gauge transformations: it is natural to identify this with the change in metric of the bulk theory. We write  $\delta g_{\mu\nu} = (L^2/r^2)\chi_{\mu\nu}$ , and then the bulk-boundary correspondence is now given by

$$\langle T_{\mu\nu}(\boldsymbol{x}_1) \dots T_{\rho\sigma}(\boldsymbol{x}_n) \rangle_{\text{CFT}} = \\ \left( \frac{ZL^2}{\kappa^2} \right)^n \lim_{r \to 0} r_1^{-D} \dots r_n^{-D} \langle \chi_{\mu\nu}(\boldsymbol{x}_1, r_1) \dots \chi_{\rho\sigma}(\boldsymbol{x}_n, r_n) \rangle_{\text{bulk}} ,$$

with Z = D.

So the minimal bulk theory for a CFT with a conserved U(1) current is the *Einstein-Maxwell* theory with a cosmological constant

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{S} &= \frac{1}{4g_M^2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{g} F_{ab} F^{ab} \\ &+ \int d^4 x \sqrt{g} \left[ -\frac{1}{2\kappa^2} \left( R + \frac{6}{L^2} \right) \right]. \end{split}$$

This action is characterized by two dimensionless parameters:  $g_M$  and  $L^2/\kappa^2$ , which are related to the conductivity  $\sigma_{\infty}$  and the central charge of the CFT

To fully match the OPE of the current operators, we need an  $\underline{Einstein-Maxwell-Weyl-scalar}$  theory

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{S}_{\text{bulk}} &= \frac{1}{g_M^2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{g} \left[ \frac{1}{4} \left[ 1 + \alpha \,\varphi(x) \right] F_{ab} F^{ab} + \gamma L^2 C_{abcd} F^{ab} F^{cd} \right] \\ &+ \int d^4 x \sqrt{g} \left[ -\frac{1}{2\kappa^2} \left( R + \frac{6}{L^2} \right) + g^{ab} \partial_a \varphi \partial_b \varphi + m^2 \varphi^2 \right], \end{split}$$

where  $C_{abcd}$  is the Weyl tensor. Stability constraints on this action restrict  $|\gamma| < 1/12$ , in agreement with results from the CFT3. The scalar field  $\varphi$  is conjugate to the CFT operator  $\mathcal{O}$  with scaling dimension  $3 - 1/\nu$ , which fixes its mass m. The coupling  $\alpha$  is determined by the OPE of the currents with  $\mathcal{O}$ .

R. C. Myers, S. Sachdev, and A. Singh, *Physical Review D* 83, 066017 (2011)
D. Chowdhury, S. Raju, S. Sachdev, A. Singh, and P. Strack, *Physical Review B* 87, 085138 (2013).
E. Katz, S. Sachdev, E. Sorensen, and W.Witczak-Krempa, arXiv:1409.3841








## Conductivity of Einstein-Maxwell theory



 $\omega/2\pi T$ 

C. P. Herzog, P. Kovtun. S. Sachdev, and D. T. Son, Physical Review D 75, 085020 (2007)

## Numerical solution of Einstein-Maxwell-Weyl-scalar theory + OPE info from QMC



E. Katz, S. Sachdev, E. Sorensen, and W. Witczak-Krempa, arXiv: 1409.3841

Quasiparticle view of quantum criticality (Boltzmann equation): Electrical transport for a (weakly) interacting CFT3



## Numerical solution of Einstein-Maxwell-Weyl-scalar theory + OPE info from QMC



E. Katz, S. Sachdev, E. Sorensen, and W. Witczak-Krempa, arXiv: 1409.3841

Strongly-coupled quantum criticality leads to a novel regime of quantum dynamics without quasiparticles.

The simplest examples are conformal field theories in 2+1 dimensions.

Quantitative predictions for transport obtained by combining the operator product expansion, quantum Monte Carlo, and the dynamics of black branes.